

Minutes of the Ninth Meeting of National Steering Committee on REDD+ held on 06 February, 2020 in the Committee Room of the Ministry of Climate Change

Ninth meeting of National Steering Committee on REDD+ was held on 06th February, 2020 in the Committee Room of Ministry of Climate Change under the chairmanship of the Secretary Ministry of Climate Change (MoCC). The list of participants is attached as **Annex-I**.

AGENDA ITEM 1: Welcome Remarks by chair and introduction of participants

2) The meeting was started with the recitation from the Holy Quran followed by welcome remarks by the chair in which she thanked all the participants for attending the meeting. The following agenda items were discussed during the meeting.

AGENDA ITEM 2: REVIEW OF PROGRESS OF IMPLEMENTATION ON DECISIONS OF EIGHTH MEETING OF NSC ON REDD+.

3) The compliance to decisions of the 8th Steering Committee on REDD+ was reviewed. Syed Ghulam Qadir Shah, the National REDD+ Coordinator (NRC) presented the actions against each decision as contained in Annex-I of the Working Paper. Discussion on key points was held as under:

4) On the decision related to Development of National REDD+ Strategy and its Implementation Framework, NRC informed that the revised draft final reports was submitted by M/S Indufor on December 23rd, 2018 which was shared with the provinces. However, almost all the provinces have raised concerns/gaps in the submitted report and did not accept it. Accordingly, no further payment has been released to the firm. He added, the contract with M/S Indufor Oy Finlandhas expired on 31-01-2019. The way forward on this contract was discussed and agreed at the meeting held on 20-08-2019 which was attended by representatives from World Bank in which it was proposed to close the existing contract and sign a new contract with the firm. Furthermore, legal opinion was obtained from Deputy Director Law, MoCC which was also found consistent with approach agreed at the meeting held on 20-08-2019. M/S Indufor has also agreed with the approach.

5) The chair asked the provincial representatives to briefly share their concerns on the report. Mr. Anwar Ali, Project Director, REDD+ Pakistan Forest Institute (PFI) and Riaz Ahmed Wagan, Provincial Focal Point Sindh remarked that the main concerns were related to implementation framework, as forestry was a provincial subject whereas the institutional framework given in the document was more like a federally controlled programme. The chair clarified that the role of Ministry of Climate Change was to provide a framework in terms of assessing, evaluating, examining and providing a way forward on deforestation and forest degradation at the national level and to deal with any subjects that fall under purview of the federal government and to deal with international conventions in accordance with rules of business. She added that implementation of forestry related activities is the responsibility of provincial departments.

6) NRC added that there were some technical gaps in the report as well in terms of analysis of drivers and deforestation and degradation, benefit sharing mechanism and overlapped institutional arrangements proposed in the strategy document which need to be rectified.

7) The chair invited comments from the forum on the proposed way forward related to this contract. Mr. Mazhar Hussain Kazmi, Procurement Specialist NRO proposed assigning the task of addressing gaps in the strategy to an individual consultant in view of underperformance of the firm. The suggestion

was not found feasible by the chair and other participants in view of the fact that assigning remaining tasks to a new entity would mean redoing entire exercise, which will involve more time and financial resources which were not available. She added that as the project needs to be implemented as per WB guidelines, WB agreed approach shall be followed. Raja Omer, DIG Forest seconded that extensive work has been done by the firm and the inception report and mid-term report submitted by the firm have already been accepted. He added that proposed way forward was discussed and agreed with WB. Some participants enquired whether any additional payment would be paid to the firm under new contract. It was clarified that the firm shall address gaps in report against the remaining unpaid value of the contract without any additional cost under a short-term contract with new terms and conditions. In view of discussion above, the proposed approach was endorsed by the forum.

8) With regard to another contract awarded to M/S Arbonaut Oy Finland for Development of Forest Reference Emission Levels/Forest Reference Level (FREL) and National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS)-Measurement and Reporting and Verification (MRV) System for REDD+, NRC informed that the firm has submitted Draft Final Report on 25-07-2019 which was shared with the provinces and all the REDD+ Focal Points of all provinces have provided acceptance of the report. He informed that the extended contract with M/S Arbonaut has also expired on 31-07-2019 and the firm has yet to submit the Final Report by addressing any remaining comments/observations.

9) Mr. Anwar Ali Project Director, REDD+ Pakistan Forest Institute (PFI) requested by sharing the Final Report with provinces incorporating the presented details. NRC mentioned that the Final Report will be shared with all the provinces once it is submitted by the firm after the way forward on this contract is finalized in consultation with WB.

Decision:

- i) The National Steering Committee endorsed the approach of closing the existing contract and signing a new contract with M/S Indufor with concurrence/NOL by the World Bank with new ToR and terms and conditions without any additional cost, against the remaining unpaid amount of contract with reference to finalization of National REDD+ Strategy and Its Implementation Framework. The firm will consult provincial forest departments to address all the technical issue in the report so that it could be finalized at the earliest.

Agenda Item 3: Confirmation of Minutes of 8th Meeting of National Steering Committee on REDD+

The minutes of the 8th National Steering Committee on REDD+ were confirmed.

Agenda Item 4: Progress Updated of REDD+ Readiness Grant funded by FCPF-WB

10) Syed Ghulam Qadir Shah, NRC gave a detailed presentation on REDD+ project being implemented with financial support from Forest Carbon Partnership Facility of World Bank. He informed that out of the four essential compliance requirements for REDD+ implementation, three requirements have almost been completed, whereas; National REDD+ Strategy is under finalization. He added, FREL report has been submitted to UNFCCC on 06 January 2020 targeting "deforestation" only, according to which approximately 1.0 million ton/annum of carbon is being emitted from deforestation with an average annual deforestation rate of 12000 ha which has been estimated based on historical

assessment cover the period 2004-12, whereas; National Forest Monitoring system (NFMS) with a web portal has been developed which will be further operationalised at national and sub-national levels.

11) NRC also presented progress status of various activities under additional funding. He informed that the need for additional activities was identified during mid-term review in consultation with the provinces. He mentioned that additional grant activities involve strengthening REDD+ implementation at sub-national level through various assessments including preparation of sub-national REDD+ Action Plans and establishment and strengthening of sub-national Forest Monitoring Systems through procurement of forest monitoring equipment, including forest monitoring drones, GIS equipment and capacity building. NRC informed that NOC for purchase of forest monitoring drone from Ministry of Interior is pending. As soon as it is received, the equipment will be procured and supplied to the provinces. He added that five out of eight consultancy assignments were at the advance stage of WB procurement process with expected signing of contracts by the end of current month. NRC also shared list of projects initiated by sub-national entities under PSDP funding. The chair appreciated efforts and interest of provincial forestry departments and stressed on need for full-time trained human resource for sustainability of provincial forestry monitoring systems.

12) Referring to forest monitoring, Mr. Faisal Ali Baloch, Deputy Chief Planning Development and Reforms said that there was a need for such a monitoring system for the on-going Ten Billion Tree Project and it is appreciable that the project has developed NFMS for Pakistan that has potential to be linked to TBTT project monitoring and National Disaster Risk Management Fund (NDRMF).

13) To a query by Dr. Ali Waqas, Director, Ministry of Foreign Affairs regarding management of data, the chair clarified that objective of procurement of forest monitoring drones and other equipment was to strengthen provincial forest departments to collect, maintain and report sub-national monitoring data.

14) Referring to study on "Establish Sub-National Forest Monitoring and Measurement Reporting & Verification Systems", the chair viewed that this was the most important study. On a query from chair, NRC informed that SUPARCO did not respond despite of several meetings and follow ups whereas, PFI expressed interest initially and declined subsequently due to capacity constraints. He added, that as an alternate meetings with Survey of Pakistan (SoP) have been held for undertaking this task in association with other partners. However, response from SoP is still awaited. To another query from chair, Mr. Faizul Bari representing FAO informed that FAO has capacity and has done similar work in different countries.

15) Mr. Anwer Ali, representing PFI, suggested that preparation of Participatory Management Plans and REDD+ Action Plans" shall consider updating existing working plans. He also suggested for piloting of REDD to which NRC responded that FCPF does not allow piloting under readiness fund; however, a concept note has been submitted to Green Climate Fund (GCF) under Simplified Approval Process (SAP) for piloting REDD+ implementation at selected sites in all the provinces. On a query from chair, Raja Omer, DIGF added that the concept note developed with support from National REDD+ Office has been submitted by MoCC through accredited entity, National Rural Support Programme (NRSP) and further response from GCF is being awaited. The chair asked for sharing the concept note with her.

16) Referring to National Internship Programme, Mr. Niaz Kakar, REDD+ Focal Point from Balochistan viewed that selection of interns shall be done by the provinces. NRC informed that interns are to be selected through advertisement as per WB Procurement Guidelines. However, the prospective applicants are required to submit internship proposals duly endorsed by designated

provincial Technical Supervisors. The chair asked NRC to share with her the details of internship programme for review.

17) Dr. Kanwal Nazim, women representative from Sindh proposed for involving academia and institutions in research activities. Mr. Afrasiyab, GIS Expert, NRO responded that NFMS web-portals would be useful platform for students to acquire latest data, facts and figures once it becomes operational.

18) Mr. Mahmood Akhtar Cheema, Country Representative of IUCN remarked that the project has made significant progress during the recent months. He hoped that with this pace and leadership by MoCC there are good chances for Pakistan to benefit from REDD+ implementation.

Decisions:

- i) The procurement process of various consultancy services under additional grant, to be undertaken by the qualified firms presented at the forum, was supported to be completed at the earliest in accordance with World Bank's Procurement Guidelines.
- ii) Follow up shall be made with Ministry of Interior to seek NOC for procurement of forest monitoring drones.
- iii) The Draft Final Report and NFMS web portal developed by M/S Arbonaut was endorsed by the forum with the need to develop and integrate national web portal with sub-national web portals. Further way forward on contract with M/S Arbonaut shall also be developed in concurrence with World Bank for submission of Final Deliverables by the firm and accordingly sharing the same with the provinces.
- iv) Follow up shall be made with Survey of Pakistan to seek their willingness or otherwise for the assignment "Establish Sub-National Forest Monitoring and Measurement Reporting & Verification Systems", else an alternate strategy may be developed to get the task completed.
- v) Procurement process for various consultancy assignments, forest monitoring equipment and hiring of additional staff shall be completed at the earliest.
- vi) Follow-up with World Bank to get the project extension formalized.
- vii) The concept note submitted to GCF shall be shared with the Chair/Secretary MoCC.
- viii) Details of National Internship Programme shall be shared with the Secretary MoCC.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks from chair.

Annex-I

S. No	Name	Designation/ Organization
1.	Naheed S. Durrani	Secretary, Ministry of Climate Change
2.	Dr. Raja Muhammad Omer	DIGF, Ministry of Climate Change
3.	Syed Ghulam Qadir Shah	National REDD+ Coordinator, National REDD+ Office
4.	Iftikhar Ul Hassan Farooqi	Project Director REDD+, Forest & wildlife department Punjab
5.	Riaz Ahmed Wagan	Chief Conservator, Forest and wildlife department Sindh
6.	Dr. Kanwal Nazim,	Women Rep, Sindh
7.	Shafi Ullah	Additional Secretary, Forest & wildlife department
8.		KPK
9.	Anwer Ali	Project Director REDD+, Pakistan Forest Institute Peshawar
10.	Niaz Khan Kakar	Project Director REDD+, Forest & Wildlife Department Balochistan
11.	Paras Maria Minhas	Women Representative, Balochistan
12.	Irtaza Qureshi,	REDD+ Focal Point, Forest and Wildlife Department AJK
13.	Dr. Zakir Hussain	Chief Conservator Forest, GB
14.	Umer Younis,	Assistant Director UN, Ministry of foreign affairs
15.	Ali Waqas Malik	Director UN, Ministry of foreign affairs
16.	Faisal Ali Baloch,	Deputy Chief, Ministry of P&D
17.	Altaf Hussain Ansari,	Director, Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Resources
18.	Shabbir Ahmed	Assistant Director, Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Resources
19.	Rana Fahad Javed,	Deputy Chief Administration, Ministry of Defence, Rawalpindi
20.	Dr. Faiz Ul Bari,	FAO, Pakistan
21.	S. M. H Zaidi,	Director Forestry, ZRK Group of Industries
22.	Ishtiaq Ahmed	Director Legal, Representative, Forest industries
23.	Mehmood Akhter Cheema	Country Rep, IUCN Pakistan
24.	Saima Younus,	Assistant Deputy Commissior, Guzara Committee, Rawalpindi
25.	Afrasiyab Muhammad	GIS/ MRV Expert, National REDD+ Office
26.	Pervez Manan	NFI Expert, National REDD+ Office
27.	Syed Mazhar Kazmi	Procurement Specialist, National REDD+ Office
28.	Sumayyah Aleem	Research Associate, National REDD+ Office
29.	Farhat Jabeen	Research Associate, National REDD+ Office